

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03331 8411

FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Spring 1998

*These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.*

1001 3-72
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 7 1998

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO


**FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS**

VOLUME I

**Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto**

Spring 1998

*These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.*



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

Volume I

I. INTRODUCTION

Georges Erasmus and Joe Sanders, *Canadian History: An Aboriginal Perspective*, in *Nation to Nation: Aboriginal Sovereignty and the Future of Canada* (Englestad & Bird eds. 1992) 3-11 1

Alan D. McMillan, *Native Peoples and Cultures of Canada* (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1988) 7

II. THE POLITICS OF INDIGENOUS DIFFERENCE

The Justice System and Aboriginal People, in 1 *Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba* (1991) 115-117..... 31

Fred Plain, *A Treatise on the Rights of the Aboriginal Peoples of the Continent of North America*, in *The Quest for Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights* (Boldt & Long eds. 1985), 31-40 33

III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

R. v. Sparrow, [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1075 42

R. v. Van der Peet, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 507 62

R. v. Gladstone, [1996] 2 S.C.R. 672 74

Note on *R. v. Nikal* (unreported SCC judgment rendered April 26, 1996).....78

Note on *R. v. Badger* (unreported SCC judgment rendered April 3, 1996).....81

IV. ABORIGINAL TITLE

A. The Royal Proclamation

The Royal Proclamation of 1763, R.S.C. 1970, App. II, No. 182

Brian Slattery, *The Hidden Constitution: Aboriginal Rights in Canada* (1984), 32 Amer. J. Comp. Law 361, at 368-72 83

B. The Marshall Trilogy

<i>Johnson v. M'Intosh</i> , 21 U.S. (8 Wheat.) 543 (1823)	87
<i>Cherokee Nation v. Georgia</i> , 30 U.S. (5 Pet.) 1 (1831)	92
<i>Worcester v. Georgia</i> , 31 U.S. (6 Pet.) 515 (1832)	95

C. The House of Lords

<i>St. Catherines Milling and Lumber Co. v. The Queen</i> (1888), 14 A.C. 46 (P.C.)	106
<i>In re Southern Rhodesia</i> , [1919] A.C. 211 (P.C.)	111
<i>Amodu Tijani v. The Secretary, Southern Nigeria</i> , [1921] 2 A.C. 399 (P.C.)	117

D. Canadian Principles

<i>Calder v. Attorney General of British Columbia</i> (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 145 (S.C.C.)	124
<i>Hamlet of Baker Lake v. Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development</i> , [1980] 1 F.C. 518 (F.C.T.D.)	137
<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.).....	150
<i>R. v. Adams</i> , [1996] 3 S.C.R. 101.....	171

E. Fiduciary Duty

<i>Guerin v. The Queen</i> (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (S.C.C.).....	179
<i>Grand Council of the Crees v. Canada (National Energy Board)</i> (1994), 112 D.L.R. (4th) 129 (S.C.C.)	191
<i>Blueberry Hill Indian Band v. Canada</i>	195

V. THE DISTRIBUTION OF LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Douglas Sanders, *The Constitution, the Provinces, and Aboriginal People*, in *Governments in Conflict: Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada* (Long & Boldt eds., 1988), 151-52 210

A. Federal Jurisdiction

Ontario Mining Co. v. Seybold, [1903] A.C. 73 (P.C.) 211

Re Eskimos, [1939] 2 D.L.R. 417 (S.C.C.) 213

Note on *R. v. Derricksan*, 60 D.L.R. (3d) 140 (B.C.C.A.); (1976), 71 D.L.R. (3d) 159 (S.C.C.) 218

B. Provincial Jurisdiction

Cardinal v. A.G. Alberta (1973), 40 D.L.R. (3d) 553 (S.C.C.)219

Kruger and Manuel v. The Queen (1977), 75 D.L.R. (3d) 434 (S.C.C.) 226

Four B. Manufacturing v. United Garment Workers of America (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 385 (S.C.C.) 231

R. v. Sutherland (1980), 113 D.L.R. (3d) 374 (S.C.C.) 239

Dick v. The Queen (1985), 23 D.L.R. (4th) 33 (S.C.C.) 241

Jack and Charlie v. The Queen (1985), 21 D.L.R. (4th) 641 (S.C.C.) 250

Delgamuukw v. British Columbia (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)..... 259

R. v. Alphonse (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.) 260

VI. TREATIES

A. Introduction

Daniel J. Kuhlen, *A Layperson’s Guide to Treaty Rights in Canada* (1985) 264

B. The Classical Approach

R. v. Syliboy, [1929] 1 D.L.R. 307 (N.S. Co. Ct.) 278

C. The Contractual Model

Pawis v. The Queen (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 602 (F.C.T.D.)..... 285

Indian Chiefs of Alberta, "Citizens Plus," in *The Only Good Indian* (1983) 290

Johnston v. The Queen (1966), 56 D.L.R. (2d) 749 (Sask. C.A.) 292

R. v. Sikyea (1964), 43 D.L.R. (2d) 150 (N.W.T.C.A.) 294

Sikyea v. The Queen, [1964] S.C.R. 642 (S.C.C.) 301

D. Recent Developments

R. v. Taylor and Williams (1981) 34 O.R. (2d) (C.A.) 301

Simon v. The Queen (1985), 24 D.L.R. (4th) 390 (S.C.C.) 310

Horse v. The Queen (1988), 47 D.L.R. (4th) 526 (S.C.C.) 322

R. v. Sioui, [1990] 70 D.L.R. (4th) 427 (S.C.C.) 329

Eastmain Band v. James Bay and Northern Quebec Agreement (Administrator)
(1992), 99 D.L.R. (4th) 16 (F.C.A.) 345

R. v. Howard (1994), 115 D.L.R. (4th) 312 (S.C.C.) 351

R. v. Badger (unreported SCC judgment rendered April 3, 1996) 357

Volume II

VII. THE INDIAN ACT

Claudia Notzke, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Natural Resources in Canada</i> (1994) 173-181	370
Leroy Little Bear, <i>Indian Government Pursuant to the Indian Act</i> , in <i>Pathways to Self-Determination: Canadian Indians and the Canadian State</i> (Little Bear, Boldt & Long eds. 1984)	381
<i>Logan v. Styres</i> (1959), 20 D.L.R. (2d) 416 (Ont. H.C.)	388
<i>R. v. Gingrich</i> (1958), 29 W.W.R. 471 (Alta. App. Div.)	392
<i>Sturgeon Lake Indian Band v. Canada</i> , [1993] F.C.J. No. 858 (Fed. C.A.).....	395
<i>Mitchell v. Peguis Indian Band</i> , [1990] 2 S.C.R. 85.....	398
<i>R. v. Charles</i> , [1995] B.C.J. No. 2995 (B.C. Prov. Ct.)	404
Frank Cassidy and Robert L. Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 40-50	408

VIII. ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE

A. Introduction

Philip Zylberberg, <i>Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?</i> (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 75-79	412
--	-----

B. "The Best Interests of the Child"

<i>Racine v. Woods</i> (1983), 1 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.)	416
<i>B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services</i> (1988), 51 Man. Rep. (2d) 245 (Man. C.A.)	426
<i>B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 291	432
<i>Tom v. Winnipeg Children's Aid Society</i> (1982), 2 W.W.R. 212 (Man. C.A.)	432

C. Recent Developments

- Philip Zylberberg, *Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?* (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 81-83 435
- C.J.K. v. Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto*, [1989] 4 C.N.L.R. 75 (Ont. Prov. Ct.) 438
- Re Family and Child Service Act of British Columbia*, [1990] 4 C.N.L.R. 14 (B.C. Prov. Ct.) 446
- Jane Doe v. Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba* (1990), 72 D.L.R. (4th) 738 (Man. Q.B.) 454

IX. RIGHTS OF THE METIS PEOPLE

- Catherine Bell, *Who Are the Métis People in Section 35(2)?* (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 351 457
- Paul Chartrand, *Aboriginal Rights: The Dispossession of the Métis* (1991), 29 Osgoode Hall L.J. 457 467
- Dumont v. A.G. Canada* (1988), 52 D.L.R. (4th) 25 (Man. C.A.) 479
- Dumont v. A. G. Canada* (1990), 67 D.L.R. (4th) 159 (S.C.C.) 491
- R. v. McPherson*, [1992] 4 C.N.L.R. 144 (Man. Prov. Ct.) 492

X. FIRST NATIONS AND THE CHARTER

A. Introduction

- Mary Ellen Turpel, *Aboriginal Peoples and the Canadian Charter: Interpretive Monopolies, Cultural Differences* (1989-90), 6 Can. Human Rights Yrbk. 3 509

B. Equality and Non-Discrimination

- Eastmain Band v. Gilpin*, [1988] 3 C.N.L.R. (Que. Prov. Ct.) 514

Manitoba Rice Farmers Association v. Manitoba Human Rights Commission
(1987), 50 Man. R. (2d) 92 (Q.B.) 527

R. v. Willocks (1995), 22 O.R. (3d) 552 (Gen. Div.) 540

Lovelace v. Ontario (1997), 33 O.R. (3d) 735 (Ont. C.A.)..... 548

C. **Aboriginal Membership and the Charter**

Batchewana Indian Band (Non-Resident Members) v. Batchewana Indian Band,
[1977] 1 F.C. 689 (C.A.)..... 564

Sawridge Band v. Canada, [1995] F.C.J. No. 1013 (F.C.T.D.) 584

Norris v. Thomas, [1992] 2 C.N.L.R. 139 (B.C.S.C.) 604

J. Anthony Long and Katherine Beaty Chiste, *Indian Governments and the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* (1994), 18 American Indian Culture and Research Journal 91 619

XI. **ABORIGINAL PEOPLES AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE**

R. v. Machekequonabe (1898), 28 O.R. 309 (Div. Ct.) 639

Re Stacey and Montour and the Queen (1981), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 61 (Que. C.A.) 641

Michael Jackson, *In Search of the Pathways to Justice: Alternative Dispute Resolution in Aboriginal Communities*, [1992] U.B.C. L. Rev. 147, at 148-160 644

R. v. Moses (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yukon Terr. Ct.) 652

Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Aboriginal Peoples and Criminal Justice* (Report No. 34, 1991), at 13-23 676

Bryan Schwartz, *A Separate Aboriginal Justice System?* (1990), 28 Man. L.J. 77 685

Jeremy Webber, *Individuality, Equality and Difference: Justifications for a Parallel System of Aboriginal Justice* (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 133 697

Teressa Nahanee, <i>Dancing With a Gorilla: Aboriginal Women, Justice and the Charter</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 359	700
<i>R. v. F.(A.)</i> , [1995] 2 C.N.L.R. 151 (Ont. Gen. Div.)	707
Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, <i>Bridging the Cultural Divide: A Report on Aboriginal People and Criminal Justice in Canada</i> (Ottawa: Supply and Services, 1996) 309-315.....	712

Volume III

XII. ABORIGINAL GOVERNMENT

A. Introduction

Chief Ovide Mercredi, <i>First Nations and Self-Determination</i> , in <i>Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century</i> (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 161-66	719
Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 160-66	723
Roger Gibbons, <i>Citizenship, Political, and Intergovernmental Problems With Indian Self-Government</i> , in <i>Arduous Journey: Canadian Indians and Decolonization</i> (Ponting ed. 1988), 369-377	728

B. Aboriginal Government and Constitutional Reform

Kathy L. Brock, <i>The Politics of Aboriginal Self-Government: A Canadian Paradox</i> (1991), 34 Can. Pub. Admin. 272	734
J. Edward Chamberlin, <i>Aboriginal Rights and the Meech Lake Accord</i> , in <i>Competing Constitutional Visions: The Meech Lake Accord</i> (Swinton & Rogerson eds., 1988), 11-19	745
<i>Draft Legal Text of the Charlottetown Accord</i> (October 9, 1992)	751

C. Aboriginal Government and the Courts

Michael Asch and Patrick Macklem, *Aboriginal Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on R. v. Sparrow* (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 498757

Hamar Foster, *Forgotten Arguments: Aboriginal Title and Sovereignty in Canada Jurisdiction Act Cases* (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 343 761

Brian Slattery, *First Nations and the Constitution: A Question of Trust* (1992), 71 Can. Bar Rev. 261 771

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, *Final Report*, vol. 2, *Restructuring the Relationship* (Ottawa: Queen's Printer, 1996), 186-90, 202-24..... 780

Casimel v. I.C.B.C. (1993), 106 D.L.R. (4th) 720 (B.C.C.A.) 793

R. v. Pamajewon and Jones; R. v. Gardner (1994), 120 D.L.R. (4th) 475 (S.C.C.) 802

D. Aboriginal Government and Negotiating Processes

Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, *Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice* (1989), 135-55 814

Task Force to Review Comprehensive Claims Policy, *Living Treaties: Lasting Agreements* (Ottawa: Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 1985) 829

Ministry of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, *Comprehensive Land Claims Policy* (1987) 837

Donald Purich, *The Inuit and Their Land* (1992) 849

Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, *British Columbia's Approach to Treaty Settlements - Lands and Resources* (May 12, 1995) 857

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, *Treaty Making in the Spirit of Co-Existence: An Alternative to Extinguishment* (1995) 870

Ministry of Indian Affairs and Northern Development: *Aboriginal Self-Government: The Government of Canada's Approach to Implementation of the Inherent Right and the Negotiation of Aboriginal Self-Government* (Ottawa:

Supply and Services, 1995).....	877
Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, <i>British Columbia's Approach to Treaty Settlements: Self-Government</i> (March 19, 1996).....	895

E. Aboriginal Government and Institutional Design

David C. Hawkes and Allan M. Maslove, <i>Fiscal Arrangements for Aboriginal Self-Government</i> , in <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Government Responsibilities: Exploring Federal and Provincial Roles</i> (Hawkes & Maslove eds., 1989), 103-106	905
Noel Lyon, <i>Aboriginal Self-Government: Rights to Citizenship and Access to Governmental Services</i> (1984), at 48-69	908
C.E.S. Franks, <i>Public Administration Questions Relating to Aboriginal Self-Government</i> (1987)	916
John Weinstein, <i>Aboriginal Self-Determination Off a Land Base</i> (1986)	931

XIII. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN THE UNITED STATES

A. General Principles

Robert N. Clinton, Nell Jessup Newton and Monroe E. Price, <i>American Indian Law</i> (3d ed. 1991), 137-164	938
<i>Ex Parte Crow Dog</i> , 109 U.S. 556 (1883)	962
Sidney L. Haring, <i>Crow Dog's Case: American Indian Sovereignty, Tribal Law, and United States Law in the Nineteenth Century</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 101-130	966
<i>United States v. Kagama</i> , 118 U.S. 375 (1886)	972
<i>Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock</i> , 187 U.S. 554 (1903)	974
<i>Tee-Hit-Ton Indians v. United States</i> , 348 U.S. 272 (1954)	976
<i>Morton v. Mancari</i> , 417 U.S. 535 (1974)	980

Lyng v. Northwest Cemetery Protective Association, 485 U.S. 439 (1988) 988

B. Tribal Government

Talton v. Mayes, 163 U.S. 376 (1896) 1001

Oliphant v. Suquamish Indian Tribe, 435 U.S. 191 (1978) 1005

Duro v. Reina, 110 Sup. Ct. 2053 (1990) 1010

Frank Pommersheim, *The Contextual Legitimacy of Adjudication in Tribal Courts and the Role of the Tribal Bar as an Interpretive Community: An Essay*, 18 New Mex. L. Rev. 49 (1988) 1016

XIV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

Garth Nettheim, *Australian Aborigines and the Law* (1987), 2 Law & Anthropology 371-84, 399-400 1032

Mabo v. Queensland, [1992] 5 C.N.L.R. 1 (Aust. H.C.) 1040

The Treaty of Waitangi, 1975 New Zealand Statutes 114, Sch. 1 1060

E. Taihakurie Durie, *The New Zealand Maorie and the Waitangi Tribunal*, in *Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century* (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 149-59 1063

